

# Health Law

J O U R N A L

visions



# Health Law

J O U R N A L

**SPECIAL EDITION**



**2008**

## visions

*Publisher*

Health Law Institute  
University of Alberta  
Edmonton, Alberta, Canada

*Editors*

Tracey M. Bailey  
Timothy Caulfield

*Associate Editors*

Mark Ammann  
Nina M. Hawkins  
Karin Kellogg  
Elizabeth Robertson

## Health Law Institute Management Board

Prof. Moe M. Litman, Chair                      Madam Justice Ellen I. Picard (*Hon. Memb.*)  
Prof. Wendy Austin                                Ms. Valerie Prather  
Dr. Renee Elio                                        Prof. Gerald B. Robertson, Q.C.  
Associate Dean Erin Nelson                      Dr. David Shragge

## Editors

Ms. Tracey M. Bailey                              Prof. Timothy Caulfield, FRSC

## Publisher

The Health Law Institute, Law Centre, University of Alberta  
Edmonton, Alberta, Canada T6G 2H5  
Phone: 780 492 8343    Fax: 780 492 9575  
Email: hli@law.ualberta.ca

Opinions and views expressed in the *Health Law Journal* are those of the individual authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the editors or the Health Law Institute. Permission to reproduce material from the *Health Law Journal* may be granted on request.

## Rates and Subscription 2009

Rates are inclusive of postage.

Health Law Journal	\$ 50.00
Health Law Journal/Health Law Review combined annual subscription	\$120.00

When purchased together with the Health Law Review, subscribers receive the Health Law Journal at a reduced rate of \$40.00.

Canadian residents add 5% GST. Payments may be made by credit card or cheque payable to the "Health Law Institute."

## Indexing and Electronic Services

The *Health Law Journal* is indexed in: Canadian Periodical Index, Index to Canadian Legal Periodicals & Books, and Sociological Abstracts. It is available through the electronic services provided by LexisNexis (Quicklaw), HeinOnline, Micromedia/ProQuest, Cengage Learning, and H.W. Wilson.

Published with the financial assistance of the Alberta Law Foundation.

ISSN 1192-8336  
ISBN 978-0-9733093-7-9

Alberta **LAW**  
**FOUNDATION**

## Information for Contributors

The *Health Law Journal* is a peer reviewed publication. Authors are invited to submit papers pertaining to medical-legal issues from a variety of perspectives, including law, philosophy, ethics, medicine, and other health care disciplines. Papers submitted for publication in the *Health Law Journal* should not have been previously published or be pending publication elsewhere.

Papers **must** conform to the *Canadian Guide to Uniform Legal Citation* 6<sup>th</sup> edition (2006). Submissions not complying with this format will be returned to the author for change. Papers should be provided double-spaced and should not exceed 10,000 words (excluding footnotes). The following information should be included: name of author(s), address, profession and affiliation.

More specific information about requirements for submission of papers is provided on the Health Law Institute's website at:  
[www.law.ualberta.ca/centres/hli](http://www.law.ualberta.ca/centres/hli).

Submissions in either English or French will be considered for publication.

The Editor reserves the right to alter grammatical construction, punctuation and citations.

All contributors will be sent an acknowledgement of receipt.

The *Health Law Journal* is published in December of each year. Deadline for submission of papers is June 30 in any year.

For further information, contact the Editor at:

Health Law Institute  
Law Centre  
University of Alberta  
Edmonton, AB T6G 2H5  
Canada

Telephone: (780) 492-8343  
Fax: (780) 492-9575  
email: [HLI@law.ualberta.ca](mailto:HLI@law.ualberta.ca)  
[www.law.ualberta.ca/centres/hli](http://www.law.ualberta.ca/centres/hli)

**VISIONS – NATIONAL HEALTH LAW CONFERENCE  
NOVEMBER 8-10, 2007 BANFF, ALBERTA**

**Co-Chairs**

**Tracey M. Bailey**

Executive Director, Health Law Institute, University of Alberta

**Timothy Caulfield, FRSC**

Canada Research Chair in Health Law and Policy

Senior Health Scholar, Alberta Heritage Foundation for Medical Research

Professor, Faculty of Law and School of Public Health

Research Director, Health Law Institute, University of Alberta

**Organizing Committee**

**Sujit Choudhry**

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

**Jocelyn Downie**

Faculty of Law and Faculty of Medicine, Dalhousie University

**Ian Kerr**

Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa

**Lara Khoury**

Faculty of Law, McGill University

**Bartha Maria Knoppers**

Centre de recherch  en droit public, Universit  de Montreal

**Patricia Peppin**

Faculty of Law, Queen's University



# visions

## National Health Law Conference

### Sponsored by





# Health Law

J O U R N A L

SPECIAL EDITION

2008

## Table of Contents

---

<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>xi</b>
<i>Tracey M. Bailey &amp; Timothy Caulfield</i>	
<b>A View of the Future: Emerging Developments in Health Care Liability</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<i>Gerald B. Robertson</i>	
<b>A “Tsunami Wave of Science”: How the Technologies of Transhumanist Medicine are Shifting Canada’s Health Research Agenda</b> .....	<b>13</b>
<i>Ian Kerr &amp; James Wishart</i>	
<b>Nutrigenomics and the Promise of Prevention: Representations and Realities</b> .....	<b>41</b>
<i>Timothy Caulfield, Jacob Shelley, Victor Alfonso, &amp; Tania Bubela</i>	
<b>Envisioning the Future of Aboriginal Health under the Health Transfer Process</b> .....	<b>67</b>
<i>Constance MacIntosh</i>	
<b>Piling on the Laws, Shedding the Pounds? The Use of Legal Tools to Address Obesity</b> .....	<b>101</b>
<i>Nola M. Ries</i>	

<b>Health Equity: HPV and the Cervical Cancer Vaccine .....</b>	<b>127</b>
<i>Joanna N. Erdman</i>	
<b>After Capacity: The Legal and Ethical Problems of Data Collection from Legally Incompetent Subjects in Canada .....</b>	<b>145</b>
<i>Tom Archibald &amp; Trudo Lemmens</i>	
<b>Relational Theory &amp; Health Law and Policy .....</b>	<b>193</b>
<i>Jocelyn Downie &amp; Jennifer Llewellyn</i>	
<b>Chaoulli: Political Undertows and Judicial Riptides .....</b>	<b>211</b>
<i>Colleen M. Flood</i>	
<b>Clearing the path for Private Health Markets in post-Chaoulli Quebec.....</b>	<b>237</b>
<i>Marie-Claude Prémont</i>	
<b>Reform, Re-form, and Reaction in the Canadian Health Care System .....</b>	<b>265</b>
<i>Robert G. Evans</i>	

## **INTRODUCTION**

Our Visions National Health Law Conference, held in Banff, Alberta in November 2007, marked the fourth such conference. Members of the health law community from across Canada had the opportunity to hear from leading scholars on a myriad of topics. The Health Law Institute at the University of Alberta hosted the first national health law conference in September 2002 in Edmonton, Alberta. This was followed by two other successful conferences hosted by the University of Toronto and Dalhousie University.

The Banff event opened with the Picard Lecture, a panel on health care reform, with presentations by Professors Colleen Flood, Marie-Claude Prémont and Robert Evans. This stimulating kick-off was followed by sessions on emerging topics in the areas of research ethics, medical liability and new health related technologies and innovation. The event stimulated wonderfully vibrant discussions and, once again, highlighted the great strengths and collegial spirit that exist within the Canadian health law community. This special edition of the Health Law Journal contains a selection of papers from the conference.

We would like to thank our sponsors for their generous support – without it this exchange of ideas and opportunity to connect with future projects in mind would not have been possible. We would also like to thank all of the participants, including presenters, chairs and registrants, who came from across Canada, and from government, practice, policy work, health care delivery and academia, to contribute to the success of this endeavour.

Tracey M. Bailey and Timothy Caulfield, Conference Co-chairs

